

MINUTES

MEETING OF THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS

PLANNING & EXTERNAL RELATIONS COMMITTEE

METROPOLITAN ATLANTA RAPID TRANSIT AUTHORITY

December 9, 2013

The Board of Directors Planning & External Relations Committee met on December 9, 2013 at 10:38 a.m. in the Board Room on the 6th Floor of the MARTA Headquarters Building, 2424 Piedmont Road, Atlanta, Georgia.

Board Members Present

Robert L. Ashe III, *Chair*
Harold Buckley, Sr.
Jim Durrett
Roderick E. Edmond
Noni Ellison-Southall
Freda B. Hardage

MARTA officials in attendance were: General Manager/ CEO Keith T. Parker, AICP; Chief Operating Officer Rich Krisak; Chief of Staff Rukiya Eaddy; Chief Administrative Officer Edward L. Johnson; Chief Financial Officer Gordon L. Hutchinson; Chief Counsel Elizabeth O'Neill; AGMs LaShanda Dawkins (Interim), Deborah Dawson, Shyam Dunna (Interim), Jonnie Keith (Acting), Cheryl King, Ryland McClendon and Terry Thompson; Executive Director Ferdinand Risco; Sr. Directors David Springstead and Donald Williams; Director John Crocker; Managers Kelly Hayden, Denise Whitfield and Beverly Williams; Executive Manager to the Board Rebbie Ellisor-Taylor; Manager, Executive Office Administration Tyrene L. Huff; Finance Administrative Analyst Tracy Kincaid. Others in attendance Davis Allen, Dontaye Brown, Jeremy Craig, Diane Graham, Anthony Pines, Srinath Remala, Robin Salter and Tuan Vo.

Also in attendance Charles Pursley, Jr. of Pursley Friese Torgrimson, LLP; Adalee LeGrand of AECOM; Matt Pollack of MATC.

Consent Agenda

- a) Approval of the November 4, 2013 Planning & External Relations Committee Meeting Minutes

On motion by Mr. Durrett seconded by Mr. Buckley, the minutes were unanimously approved by a vote of 5 to 0, with 5 members present.

Individual Agenda

Resolution Authorizing Modification of the Contract for Procurement of MARTA Concessions Snack Vending, RFP P25327

Ms. Whitfield presented this resolution for Board of Directors' approval authorizing the General Manager/CEO or his delegate to approve the contract modification to modify the Minimum Annual Guarantee Base Rent for Agreement Year One to \$68,212.00; Agreement Year Two to \$90,000.00, and Agreement Year Three to \$92,000.00 for the three (3) year contract term, for a total modified contract value of \$250,212.00 for Contract P25327, procurement of MARTA Concessions Snack Vending.

Dr. Edmond asked about the length of the contract.

Ms. Whitfield said three years.

Dr. Edmond asked why the City of Atlanta 1984 Grant of Easements for Airport Station was not noticed before.

Ms. Whitfield said MARTA performed due diligence, however, it was overlooked by internal measures.

Dr. Edmond asked how did Gilly determine a substantial loss.

Ms. Whitfield said the loss was determined through the help of a consultant. There was no sales history.

Dr. Edmond asked if they provided any ridership information to substantiate these numbers.

Dr. Crocker said Gilly provided figures based on sales per entry.

Dr. Edmond asked if MARTA considered putting the contract back out for bid.

Ms. Whitfield said MARTA received only one bid for the snack RFP, which was Gilly Vending and two for beverages - Gilly and Coca Cola. As a result, MARTA decided to wait until the end of the contract.

Dr. Edmond said he is not comfortable with moving forward – there is a wide discrepancy and the Easement was not discovered beforehand. He recommended the Authority start over.

Mr. Hutchinson said one of the lessons learned is in the future MARTA will insist that estimated revenue is done station by station. When this contract expires, MARTA will be in a much better position and will be able to put out the snack and beverage vending at the same time.

Mr. Ashe asked when will the snack and beverage vending go out.

Ms. Whitfield said MARTA will start the process in September 2014.

Mr. Ashe asked if MARTA approached the City about revising the Easement.

Ms. Whitfield said the City would have accepted a proposal for revenue sharing from MARTA but did not encourage MARTA to move forward with it because they would have to get the approval of some 100-200 concessionaires already doing business at the airport.

Dr. Edmond asked what if MARTA cancels the contract.

Mrs. O'Neill said there is a Termination for Convenience clause in the contract; however, the vendor paid for electrical outlets so MARTA would have to pay for that.

On motion by Mr. Durrett seconded by Mr. Buckley, the resolution was approved by a vote of 4 to 1, with 5 members present.

Dr. Edmond voted no.

Resolution Authorizing the Solicitation of Proposals for Joint Development of Parcel D3166 at Brookhaven/Oglethorpe University Station, RFP P31778

Dr. Crocker presented this resolution for Board of Directors' approval authorizing the General Manager/CEO or his delegate to solicit proposals for the Joint Development of Parcel D3166 at Brookhaven/Oglethorpe University Station by means other than competitive bidding, in accordance with Section 14(m) of the MARTA Act, through the use of Request for Proposals.

Mr. Durrett asked about the property west of Parcel D3166.

Dr. Crocker said the property is a detention center that MARTA owns near the Brookhaven Library.

Mr. Durrett asked if this could become a larger opportunity.

Dr. Crocker said there has been some discussion about moving the library.

Dr. Edmond said MARTA should be very specific in its responses as it relates to city ordinances.

Dr. Crocker said MARTA has changed the language of its responses based on previous Board discussion.

Mr. Ashe asked if the City of Brookhaven will have a role in the evaluation phase.

Dr. Crocker said MARTA has asked and is waiting to see if Brookhaven are a part of the development. It is in discussion.

Mr. Ashe asked if that is problematic.

Dr. Crocker said they could serve as a non-voting member on the Evaluation Committee.

On motion by Mr. Durrett seconded by Mr. Buckley, the resolution was approved by a vote of 4 to 0, with 5 members present.

Mrs. Hardage abstained.

Briefing – Proposed Service Changes for the April 2014 Mark-up

Mr. Hayden briefed the Committee on the proposed Service Changes for April 2014 subject to comments from the public at Public Meetings as well as a Public Hearing.

April 2014 Mark-up Highlights

- Improve On-Time Performance
- Improve Weekend and Midday Bus Frequency
- Improve Rail Service

Planning & External Relations Committee

12/9/13

Page 5

- Improve Bus Route Efficiency-"Right Size" The Service
- Respond To Customer Requests

Improve On-Time Performance

- Analyze total trip times and delay locations
- Focus on, but not limited to 5 weekday routes, 3 Saturday routes and 3 Sunday routes having the highest LATE trip recordings
- Analyze passenger loads
- Modify frequency of service as necessary
- Adjust trips where necessary

Improve Weekend and Midday Bus Frequency

- Improve the frequency of service during the midday weekdays and on weekends for some services as demand warrants
- Improve peak service as bus availability allows

Improve Bus Route Efficiency

- *"Right Size" Services; Match ridership demand to service frequency during the peak hours of service*

Improve Rail Service

- Improve frequency of Rail Service during peak periods

Public Hearing Schedule

- Where – 4 Separate Locations *(to be determined)*
- When – Week of January 13, 2014
- Time – *(to be determined)*

Dr. Edmond said he would like to revisit the Braves shuttle data – how much is it costing MARTA versus the revenue received from it as well as the market value of the service.

Mr. Parker said that information was recently reviewed and will be provided the Board in the coming weeks.

Briefing – Quality of Service

Dr. Salter presented the Fiscal Year 2013 Annual Quality of Service Study.

- The Quality of Service (QOS) Survey is a comprehensive survey that tracks customer satisfaction and perceptions of MARTA's service attributes throughout the year
- The QOS FY2013 Annual Presentation includes findings from 6,715 surveys that were collected from July 2012 through June 2013, with comparisons to previous fiscal years
- In FY2013 there were modest increases in satisfaction with rail service and with MARTA overall
- The number of performance attributes that riders perceived to be strengths remained low, and a high number of performance attributes remained in the focus quadrant (high in importance but low in performance)
 - The initial increase in focus attributes and decrease in strengths occurred in FY12
- Performance attributes in the focus quadrant are related primarily to communication, service delays and weekend service
 - Strengths were performance attributes related to safety, weekday service and buses displaying correct information
- Fewer patrons observed nuisance behaviors on the buses, trains and in rail stations in FY13
- In FY12 the percentage of riders who reported seeing the six most common nuisance behaviors declined after spiking upwards in FY11
- The rise in reported nuisance behaviors in FY11 followed cutbacks in personnel but were significantly reduced by a MARTA Police campaign in FY12
- In FY13 reports of these behaviors remained low or continued to decrease
- Almost three-fourths of riders who had seen a nuisance behavior in the past 30 days said that it had not changed their feelings about MARTA or their riding behavior

Planning & External Relations Committee

12/9/13

Page 7

- About one-fifth of riders said that their opinions had worsened at least a little and made changes in their riding behavior such as avoiding certain times or locations or riding less
- The Quality of Service Survey will continue monitoring the reported incidence of nuisances, their impact on rider perceptions and behavior and changes that may be attributed to the Authority's Ride with Respect campaign

Mr. Ashe asked how does MARTA's On-Time Performance metrics compare with customer perception.

Mr. Parker said the customer's perception is accurate. MARTA's fleet quality is not where it needs to be which leads to service interruptions and delays. Over the next six months, MARTA's fleet will undergo a complete overhaul. This along with other strategies will address OTP.

Other Matters

Mr. Parker announced the resignation of Deborah Dawson, Assistant General Manager (AGM) of Human Resources, effective December 13, 2013. Parker thanked Mrs. Dawson for her years of service to the Authority and wished her well as she accepts a new position within the state government of Rhode Island. He added that while the Authority searches for a replacement. LaShanda Dawkins, from MARTA's Legal Services Department, will serve as Interim AGM of Human Resources.

Mrs. McClendon announced the following upcoming events:

- Title VI Community Meeting
 - December 9 – 1:00pm
 - December 10 – 6:00pm
 - December 12 – 6:00pm
- State of MARTA – December 13 – 7:30am
- MARTOC Meeting – December 13 – 2:00pm
- Customer Appreciation Event at Five Points – December 19 – 4:45pm
- Employees' Charity Club Holiday Shop December 20-21 – 8:00am
- ASO Performance at Arts Center – December 20 – 4:45pm

Planning & External Relations Committee
12/9/13
Page 8

Mr. Durrett said the Employees' Charity Club Holiday Shop is a great event and encouraged Board Members to attend if their schedules permit.

Adjournment

The Planning & External Relations Committee meeting adjourned at 11:40 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, reading "Kellee N. Mobley", written over a horizontal line.

Kellee N. Mobley
Senior Executive Administrator to the Board